

## Christ Church Library, Carroll Collection

Digitised image notes and captions by Edward Wakeling

### Carroll-MS 10 - Note on Fallacy in *Symbolic Logic* with a possible example from *Sylvie and Bruno*

#### Introductory notes:

This manuscript is part of the Warner Bequest. It consists of text that Dodgson probably intended to use in *Symbolic Logic, Part II* or *Part III*. However, Dodgson indicated in a margin note that he was making reference to Chapter XVI of *Sylvie and Bruno*, entitled "The Changed Crocodile."

Carroll-mss\_0070-ms10\_r

The text reads as follows:

J  
Note 9

But whoever said it did?

There really ought to be some name for this fallacy – it is so favorite a weapon in modern controversy – of denying some absurd proposition, in such a way as to leave the impression that the opponent has asserted it. In default of a better name, let us call it "The Milkmaid's Fallacy."

"Then I won't marry you, my pretty Maid."

"Nobody asked you, Sir" she said.

Here she clearly convicts the old bean of denying a proposition which she had never enunciated.

So far from having written in the interests of *examiners*, I hold that they exist simply for the sake of examinations, and that examinations exist simply as a part – and that the least important part – of the machinery of *teaching*.

[Margin note]

Vol. I.

[After B. has told about crocodiles saying "why shouldn't I

The B. probably stands for Bruno. The text referred to here comes from *Sylvie and Bruno*, and is as follows:

This was a good deal worse than the last puzzle. Please, dear Child, help again!

"I don't believe no Crocodile never walked along its own forehead!" Sylvie cried, too much excited by the controversy to limit the number of her negatives.

"Oo don't know the *reason* why it did it!" Bruno scornfully retorted. "It had a welly good reason. I *heard* it say 'Why *shouldn't* I walk on my own forehead?' So a course it *did*, oo know!"

The text in this manuscript is not from *Sylvie and Bruno* but Dodgson is merely using it as a possible example. The meaning of "J" and "Note 9" are not clear.

Carroll-mss\_0071-ms10\_v

The verso indicates that Dodgson makes reference to Chapter XVI in *Sylvie and Bruno* (1889) entitled "The Changed Crocodile."