

## Christ Church Library, Carroll Collection

Digitised image notes and captions by Edward Wakeling

### Carroll-MS 3 - A Disputed Point in Logic

#### Introductory notes:

This is another manuscript from the Warner Bequest. It concerns Dodgson's paper "A Disputed Point in Logic." The paper was the result of a protracted discussion between Dodgson and the professor of Logic at Oxford, John Cook Wilson (1849-1915). In the paper, Dodgson assumes the role of "Outis" and Wilson is "Nemo," Dodgson quoting him verbatim from letters received. Dodgson wrote in his diary on 31 March 1894: "Have just got printed, as a leaflet, *A Disputed Point in Logic*, the point Prof. Wilson and I have been arguing so long. This paper is *wholly* in his own words, and puts the point very clearly. I think of submitting it to all my logical friends." The problem was as follows:

There are two Propositions, A and B.

Let it be granted that

If A is true, B is true ..... (i)

Let there be another Proposition C, such that

If C is true, then if A is true B is not true .....(ii)

Wilson said that C cannot be true; Dodgson said it may be. He sent the paper to various logicians including one to James Welton and included the following letter (MS. Princeton):

Dear Sir,

I am anxious to collect the opinions of students of Logic on the enclosed paper, and shall be greatly obliged if you will favour me with *yours*, as briefly as possible.

The paper need not be returned to me. Believe me

Faithfully yours,

C. L. Dodgson

Further letters passed between the two men as various logical points were discussed and clarified. Six of Dodgson's letters to Welton survive at Princeton. James Welton (1854-1942) was, for some years, a teacher in elementary schools, but then matriculated at Caius College, Cambridge in 1888: BA 1891, in charge of the department for training teachers at the Yorkshire College, Leeds 1891-1905, MA 1895, DLit (London) 1914, and professor of education at Leeds University 1905-16. Another logician that Dodgson consulted was Francis Herbert Bradley (1846-1924) who matriculated at University College in 1865: scholar 1865, BA 1870, fellow of Merton College from 1870, MA 1877, writer on philosophical subjects including *The Principles of Logic* (1883). A similar letter was sent to him dated 16 April 1894.

Two corrections to Dodgson's paper entitled *A Disputed Point in Logic*. The printed paper is dated April 1894. A copy of this paper, with these corrections incorporated, exists.

Carroll-mss\_0034-ms3\_v

The verso is blank